

RFQ 138-0-2009/AT Architectural / Engineering Design Services for Sumter County Fire & Rescue Stations Renovation of #32 Oxford and #31 Wildwood, New Construction #22 West Bushnell and #33 Coleman, FL Selection Review Committee Meeting held on October 13, 2009 at 1:00pm in the Supervisor of Elections (SOE) Conference Room, located at 910 North Main Street, Bushnell, FL 33513.

Bill Gulbrandsen, Bob Kegan, Doug Conway, MJ Rutter, Art Bisner, and Amanda Taylor were present to represent staff.

Amanda stated the purpose of this meeting was to take the fifteen submitted proposals to a short list that would make presentations on a date to be determined by the committee. After the vendor presentations a recommendation would be taken to the BOCC on 10-27-2009 to enter into contract negotiations.

Amanda turned the meeting over to the Selection Committee.

The committee agreed to pull the following listed below:

Starnier Ranaldi – did not provide a critical path schedule

Senatore – did not follow packet guidelines

Sinner Vignola McLean – did not provide a critical path schedule

Rowe – appeared to have limited experience with fire stations, did not provide a detailed schedule within the packet, and did not include a critical path schedule

The committee discussed: Architecture Studio, Inc., Baker Barrios, Bacon Group, EMO, Gora McGahey, KBJ, KP Studio, PQH, Powell Design, SCMH, and Stottler Staggs & Associates.

The group agreed to short list down to the top six (6) companies.

Architecture Studio – good schedule and were based out of Ocala, FL

Baker Barrios – good team, packet and schedule availability, and were based out of Orlando, FL

Bacon Group – detailed team, job specific experience, good timeline turn around, and were based out of Clearwater, FL

EMO – after discussion the selection committee decided to pull based on the company being out of Tallahassee

Gora McGahey – after discussion the selection committee decided to pull based on the company being out of Ft Myers

KBJ – good packet submittal, renovations were similar to Sumter County projects, and were based out of Orlando, FL

KP Studio – good packet, similar work experience, and were based out of Ocala, FL

Powell Design Group – presented good individuality, good schedule, and were based out of Orlando, FL

PQH – after discussion the selection committee decided to pull based on the company being out of Jacksonville, FL

SCHM – after discussion the selection committee decided to pull based on lack of depth in packet information, that MEP's were with different firms
Stottler Stagg & Associates – schedule did not reflect good time according with what the schedule for the projects needed to be.

The six (6) companies that were shortlisted for vendor presentations are as follows in no particular order:

Architecture Studio, KBJ, Powell Design Group, Baker Barrios, Bacon Group, and KP Studio

See scoring sheets for short listing of the companies attached.

The selection committee agreed to hold twenty (20) minute interviews with ten (10) minutes for questions and answers on Friday, 10-16-2009 starting at 1:00pm in Room 142.

The meeting adjourned at 2:20pm.

Selection Review Committee Meeting

SIGN - IN SHEET

DATE: 10-13-2009

TIME: 1pm SOE Conf. Room

BID NAME: RFQ 138-0-2009/AT

NAME

COMPANY

Amarda Taylor

BEP BOCC

ART BISWEN

BEP BOCC

ANDREW PETRUSKY

BERGMANN ASSOC. w/ THE BAUM GROUP

Mary JO Rutter

BOCC FIDM

Joseph J. Conway

SCBCC FIDM

Bill Broskat

Contemporary Interior

Robert J. Leggett

BOCC - Building Services

Mark W. Miller

Santa Clara County Fire House

Bob Kegan short list
scoring.

SUMTER COUNTY BOCC
FACILITIES DEVELOPMENT
RFQ TAB RESULTS
PREPARED BY

PROPOSAL
SUBMITTED
DATED
10.05. 2009

REQUEST FOR QUALIFICATIONS (RFQ) 138- 0-2009
SUMTER COUNTY FIRE AND RESCUE STATIONS
RENOVATIONS TO FS # 31 OXFORD & FS #31 WILDWOOD
NEW CONSTRUCTION OF FS # 22 WEST BUSHNELL & FS # 33 COLEMAN

RFQ TABULATION

	1.0	2.0	3.0	4.0	5.0	6.0	7.0
CONTRACTORS	ARCHITECTURE STUDIO	BAKER BARRIOS	BACON GROUP	EMO ARCHITECTS	GORA McGAHEY	KBG ARCHITECTS	K P STUDIO ARCHITECTS
LOCATIONS	OCALA	ORLANDO	CLEARWATER	TALLAHASSEE	FORT MYERS	ORLANDO	OCALA
MEP -- ENGINEERS	TLC	INGENUITY	INGENUITY	H2 ENGINEERING	HSA ENGINEERS	INGENUITY	VERRANDO
STRUCTURAL ENGINEER		STRUCTURES ONE	MASTER CONS	ROSENBAUM	TKW CONSULTING	ADVANCED STRUCTURAL	SEP
CIVIL ENGINEER	AMERICAN HERITAGE	GRIFFEY	GRIFFEY	FARNER BARLEY	JOHNSON ENGINEERING	GRIFFEY	FARNER BARLEY
OTHER ENGINEERS							
SURVEYING			ATLANTIC				
LANDSCAPE ARCHITECTS	EDK		LA DESIGN		JOHNSON ENGINEERING	JCR CONSULT.	MIKE PAPE
GEOTECHNICAL ENGINEERS	GEO - TECHN		ANDREYEV	NODARSE			
CONSTRUCTION COST CONSULTANTS							
FIRE STATION EXPERIENCE	YES (7)	YES (5)	YES (10)	YES (100+)	YES (10)	YES (9)	YES (6)
FIRE STATION PROTOTYPE	YES	YES (3)	YES			YES	YES
DESIGN COMPLETION DATE			INCLUDE	INCL 11 17 2010	DLC CPM		INCL 08 31 2010
LEED OR OTHER GREEN BLDG CERTIFICATION	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
10 A) FIRM DESCRIPTION		10	10	10	10	10	10
35 B) EXPERIENCE & ABILITY TO MEET THE BUDGET		35	35	35	35	20	20
20 C) DESIGN PLAN		20	20	20	20	10	15
10 D) SERVICES		10	10	10	10	5	5
15 E) SCHEDULE		15	0	15	15	0	0
5 F) CERTIFIED MINORITY BUSINESS ENTERPRISE		0	0	0	0	0	0
5 G) OTHER BENEFITS		5	0	5	5	0	0
TOTAL POINTS EARNED		95	75	95	95	45	50
COMMENTS	Architecture Experience	So so	Bacon CPM looks good	EMO Wow - Graphics Long way	Long way - Short	KBJ So so	KP studio Village experience

8.0	9.0	10.0	11.0	12.0	13.0	14.0	15.0
POWELL DESIGN ARCHITECTS	PQH ARCHITECTS	ROWE ARCHITECTS	SCMH ARCHITECTS	SKINNER VIGNOLA	SENATORE ARCHITECTS	STAMER RANALDI	STOTTLER STAGG
ORLANDO	JACKSONVILLE	TAMPA	LAKELAND	GAINESVILLE	LEESBURG	OVIEDO	CAPE CANAVERAL
INGENUITY	MCVEIGH - MANGUM	ANSTON GREENLEES MASTER	HART & ASSOC GRAMLISH & ASSOC BBM STRUCT	MATERN	MIKE AYERS	MATERN	INGENUITY
PLOWFIELD & ASSOC	MCVEIGH - MANGUM			WAYLAND	MIKE AYERS	BBM	NOBLE
GRIFFEY	H & B CONSULTING	FARNER BARLEY		CAUSSEAU	CAMPANALE	LONDON	GRIFFEY
HUGHES ASSOC FIRE SUPPRESSION							
		FARNER BARLEY			HALL - FARNER		STOTTLER
BONNETT DESIGN	A & K	CONNER & ASSOC				NATIVE FLA	BELLOMO HERBET
	ELLIS & ASSOC	ANDREYEV			UNIVERSAL ENG.		ELLIS & ASSOC
CARLSSON INC		CC & ASSOC					
YES (7) NO	YES (7) YES	YES (4) NO	YES (4) NO	YES (6) YES	NO NO	YES (7) YES	YES (8) NO
COMM. TO MEET CPM YES	YES	YES	YES			YES	NO
5	10	10	5	10	10	5	
20	30	30	15	30	30	30	
10	15	20	10	10	15	15	
5	10	10	5	10	10	10	
0	15	0	5	0	0	0	
0	0	15	0	0	0	0	
0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
40	80	85	40	60	65	60	
Powell	PQH	Rowe	SCMH		Senatore		
So so	Long way to travel	Looks good	MEP ARE FRAGMENT	So so	Has potential	So so	So so

Doug Conway short list scoring.

**SUMTER COUNTY BOCC
FACILITIES DEVELOPMENT
RFQ TAB RESULTS
PREPARED BY DOUG CONWAY**

PROPOSAL
SUBMITTED
DATED
10.05. 2009

PROPOSAL
REVIEW
DATED
10.13.2008

**REQUEST FOR QUALIFICATIONS (RFQ) 138- 0-2009
SUMTER COUNTY FIRE AND RESCUE STATIONS
RENOVATIONS TO FS # 31 OXFORD & FS #31 WILDWOOD
NEW CONSTRUCTION OF FS # 22 WEST BUSHNELL & FS # 33 COLEMAN**

RFQ TABULATION

	1.0	2.0	3.0	4.0	5.0	6.0	7.0
CONTRACTORS	ARCHITECTURE	BAKER	BACON	EMO	GORA	KBJ	K P STUDIO
	STUDIO	BARRIOS	GROUP	ARCHITECTS	McGAHEY	ARCHITECTS	ARCHITECTS
LOCATIONS	OCALA	ORLANDO	CLEARWATER	TALLAHASSEE	FORT MYERS	ORLANDO	OCALA
MEP -- ENGINEERS	TLC	INGENUITY	INGENUITY	H2 ENGINEERING	HSA ENGINEERS	INGENUITY	VERRANDO
STRUCTURAL ENGINEER		STRUCTURES ONE	MASTER CONS	ROSENBAUM	TKW CONSULTING	ADVANCED STRUCTURAL	SEP
CIVIL ENGINEER	AMERICAN HERITAGE	GRIFFEY	GRIFFEY	FARNER BARLEY	JOHNSON ENGINEERING	GRIFFEY	FARNER BARLEY
OTHER ENGINEERS							
SURVEYING			ATLANTIC				
LANDSCAPE ARCHITECTS	EDK		LA DESIGN		JOHNSON ENGINEERING	JCR CONSULT.	MIKE PAPE
GEOTECHNICAL ENGINEERS	GEO - TECHN		ANDREYEV	NODARSE			
CONSTRUCTION COST CONSULTANTS							
FIRE STATION EXPERIENCE	YES (7)	YES (5)	YES (10)	YES (100+)	YES (10)	YES (9)	YES (6)
FIRE STATION PROTOTYPE	YES	YES (3)	YES	YES		YES	YES
DESIGN COMPLETION DATE			INCLUDE	INCL 11 17 2010	DLC CPM		INCL 08 31 2010
LEED OR OTHER GREEN BLDG CERTIFICATION	YES	XXX	YES	XXX	YES	YES	XXX
10 A) FIRM DESCRIPTION	8	8	8	7	7	8	
35 B) EXPERIENCE & ABILITY TO MEET THE BUDGET	25	27	25	25	25	30	
20 C) DESIGN PLAN	15	18	17	15	13	17	
10 D) SERVICES	7	8	7	8	6	8	
15 E) SCHEDULE	14	12	13	10	15	12	
5 F) CERTIFIED MINORITY BUSINESS ENTERPRISE	5	0	0	0	FOR SUBS NOT PRIM	0	0
5 G) OTHER BENEFITS	3	3	3	4	0	3	
TOTAL POINTS EARNED	77	76	73	69	66	78	
COMMENTS				BAD PROJECT EXAMPLES			
LEAST LIKELY TO MAKE THE SHORT LIST DUE TO SKILL'S AND OR EXPERIENCE OR SCHEDULE					*****		
	SHORT LIST FIRM	SHORT LIST FIRM	SHORT LIST FIRM			SHORT LIST FIRM	SHORT LIST FIRM

8.0	9.0	10.0	11.0	12.0	13.0	14.0	15.0
POWELL DESIGN	PQH	ROWE	SCMH	SKINNER	SENATORE	STAMER	STOTTLER
ARCHITECTS	ARCHITECTS	ARCHITECTS	ARCHITECTS	VIGNOLA	ARCHITECTS	RANALDI	STAGG
ORLANDO	JACKSONVILLE	TAMPA	LAKELAND	GAINESVILLE	LEESBURG	OVIEDO	CAPE CANAVERAL
INGENUITY	MCVEIGH - MANGUM	ANSTON	HART & ASSOC	MATERN	MIKE AYERS	MATERN	INGENUITY
PLOWFIELD & ASSOC	MCVEIGH - MANGUM	GREENLEES	GRAMLISH & ASSOC	WAYLAND	MIKE AYERS	BBM	NOBLE
		MASTER	BBM STRUCT				
GRIFFEY	H & B CONSULTING	FARNER BARLEY		CAUSSEAU	CAMPANALE	LONDON	GRIFFEY
HUGHES ASSOC							
FIRE SUPPRESSION							
		FARNER BARLEY			HALL - FARNER		STOTTLER
BONNETT DESIGN	A & K	CONNER & ASOC				NATIVE FLA	BELLOMO
	ELLIS & ASSOC	ANDREYEV			UNIVERSAL ENG.		HERBET
							ELLIS & ASSOC
CARLSSON INC		CC & ASSOC					
YES (7)	YES (7)	YES (4)	YES (4)	YES (6)	NO	YES (7)	YES (8)
NO	YES	NO	NO	YES	NO	YES	YES
COMM. TO MEET CPM							03 17 2011
YES	YES	YES	YES			YES	YES
8	9	8	7	6	5	5	
27	27	20	17	15	15	15	
15	12	12	11	10	10	10	
7	8	6	5	7	6	5	
12	12	5	3	0	0	0	
0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
3	0	0	0	0	0	0	
72	68	51	43	38	36	35	
			MEP ARE FRAGMENT				GOOD PROJECT
							EXAMPLES
SHORT LIST FIRM							

SUMTER COUNTY BOCC
FACILITIES DEVELOPMENT
RFQ TAB RESULTS
PREPARED BY

PROPOSAL
SUBMITTED
DATED
10.05. 2009

REQUEST FOR QUALIFICATIONS (RFQ) 138-0-2009
SUMTER COUNTY FIRE AND RESCUE STATIONS
RENOVATIONS TO FS # 31 OXFORD & FS #31 WILDWOOD
NEW CONSTRUCTION OF FS # 22 WEST BUSHNELL & FS # 33 COLEMAN

RFQ TABULATION

	1.0	2.0	3.0	4.0	5.0	6.0	7.0
CONTRACTORS	ARCHITECTURE STUDIO	BAKER BARRIOS	BACON GROUP	EMO ARCHITECTS	GORA McGAHEY	KBG ARCHITECTS	K P STUDIO ARCHITECTS
LOCATIONS	OCALA	ORLANDO	CLEARWATER	TALLAHASSEE	FORT MYERS	ORLANDO	OCALA
MEP -- ENGINEERS	TLC	INGENUITY	INGENUITY	H2 ENGINEERING	HSA ENGINEERS	INGENUITY	VERRANDO
STRUCTURAL ENGINEER		STRUCTURES ONE	MASTER CONS	ROSENBAUM	TKW CONSULTING	ADVANCED STRUCTURAL	SEP
CIVIL ENGINEER	AMERICAN HERITAGE	GRIFFEY	GRIFFEY	FARNER BARLEY	JOHNSON ENGINEERING	GRIFFEY	FARNER BARLEY
OTHER ENGINEERS							
SURVEYING			ATLANTIC				
LANDSCAPE ARCHITECTS	EDK		LA DESIGN		JOHNSON ENGINEERING	JCR CONSULT.	MIKE PAPE
GEOTECHNICAL ENGINEERS	GEO - TECHN		ANDREYEV	NODARSE			
CONSTRUCTION COST CONSULTANTS							
FIRE STATION EXPERIENCE	YES (7)	YES (6)	YES (10)	YES (100+)	YES (10)	YES (9)	YES (6)
FIRE STATION PROTOTYPE	YES	YES (3)	YES			YES	YES
DESIGN COMPLETION DATE			INCLUDE	INCL 11 17 2010	DLC CPM		INCL 08 31 2010
LEED OR OTHER GREEN BLDG CERTIFICATION	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
10 A) FIRM DESCRIPTION	7	0	8	0	6	0	6
35 B) EXPERIENCE & ABILITY TO MEET THE BUDGET	2.8	0	2.9	0	3.5	0	2.8
20 C) DESIGN PLAN	0	0	0	0	1.8	0	0
10 D) SERVICES	5	0	5	0	7	0	8
15 E) SCHEDULE	12	0	0	0	12	0	12
5 F) CERTIFIED MINORITY BUSINESS ENTERPRISE	5	0	5	0	5	0	0
5 G) OTHER BENEFITS	5	0	5	0	5	0	5
TOTAL POINTS EARNED	62	0	52	0	89	0	59
COMMENTS							

* Short list scoring sheet.

	80	90	100	110	120	130	140	150	
POWELL DESIGN ARCHITECTS	POH ARCHITECTS	ROWE ARCHITECTS	SCMH ARCHITECTS	SKINNER VIGNOLA	SENATORE ARCHITECTS	STAMER RANALDI	STOTTLER STAGG		
ORLANDO	JACKSONVILLE	TAMPA	LAKELAND	GAINESVILLE	LEESBURG	OVIDEO	CAPE CANAVERAL		
INGENUITY	MCVEIGH - MANGUM	ANSTON GREENLEES MASTER	HART & ASSOC GRAMLISH & ASSOC BBM STRUCT	MATERN WAYLAND	MIKE AYERS	MATERN BBM	INGENUITY NOBLE		
PLOWFIELD & ASSOC	MCVEIGH - MANGUM	FARNER BARLEY		CAUSSEAUX	CAMPANALE	LONDON	GRIFFEY		
HUGHES ASSOC FIRE SUPPRESSION		FARNER BARLEY			HALL - FARNER		STOTTLER		
BONNETT DESIGN	A & K	CONNER & ASOC				NATIVE FLA	BELLOMO HERBET ELLIS & ASSOC		
	ELLIS & ASSOC	ANDREYEV			UNIVERSAL ENG.				
CARLSSON INC		CC & ASSOC							
YES (7) YES NO COMM. TO MEET CPM YES	YES (7) YES	YES (4) NO	YES (4) NO	YES (6) YES	NO NO	YES (7) YES	YES (8) NO		
	YES	YES	YES			YES	NO		
0 10 0 23 0 15 0 8 0 10 0 0 0 5 0 81	0 5 0 22 0 0 0 5 0 12 0 5 0 0 0 49	0 5 0 15 0 0 0 3 0 0 0 0 0 5 0 28	0 5 0 15 0 0 0 2 0 0 0 0 0 5 0 27	0 6 0 23 0 0 0 5 0 0 0 0 0 2 0 36	0 4 0 5 0 0 0 2 0 0 0 0 0 5 0 17	0 6 0 23 0 0 0 5 0 0 0 0 0 3 0 37	0 6 0 20 0 0 0 5 0 10 0 5 0 0 0 46	0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0	
			MEP ARE FRAGMENT						